



The Uganda Investing in Forests and Protected Areas for Climate-Smart Development Project (P170466)

Consultation with the Batwa Indigenous Community

Participation in Project Processes

Prepared by:

BioVision Africa

With support from:

Bank Information Center

For further information on the issues raised in this report, please contact Bank Information Center at:

1023 15th St. NW, 10th Floor,
Washington, DC 20005

Tel.: (202) 737-7752

Email: info@bankinformationcenter.org

www.bankinformationcenter.org

Table of Contents

Introduction	3
Project Monitoring Background and Purpose.....	4
The Monitoring Mission in Western Uganda.....	4
Project Compliance with World Bank Standards	6
1. Community Health and Safety (ESS4).....	6
2. Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement (ESS5).....	7
3. Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources (ESS6)	8
4. Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities (ESS7)	8
5. Cultural Heritage (ESS8).....	9
6. Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure (ESS10)	9
Recommendations.....	10
1. Recommendations for the project/government:.....	10
2. Recommendations for the World Bank:	11
3. Recommendations for Local Communities and Civil Society:	11
Annexes.....	12
Annex 1: Species used by the Batwa to treat common ailments.....	12
Annex 2: Ministry of Water and Environment responses to the Report .	13

Introduction

The World Bank's Board of Executive Directors approved total financing of US\$148.2 million on April 23, 2020, to enable Uganda to improve sustainable management of forests and protected areas and increase benefits to forest-dependent communities, including refugees and their host communities. \$78.2 million of this financing is a concessional credit, while \$70 million is a grant, including from the International Development Association's (IDA18)¹ sub-window for refugees and host communities. The [Uganda Investing in Forests and Protected Areas for Climate-Smart Development Project](#) ("the Project"), which is planned to run through June 30, 2026, will focus on the Albertine Region and the refugee-hosting areas in Northern Uganda. Approved by Uganda's Cabinet on February 1, 2021, it is pending approval by the Parliament.

The Albertine landscape sustains a large and rapidly growing population, biodiversity of globally important significance which protect and deliver important ecosystems services. This landscape is also central to Uganda's tourism industry, which makes a major contribution to Uganda's economy in terms of foreign exchange earnings, jobs, and revenue. It is estimated that Uganda's natural capital contributed almost 40 percent to overall wealth in 2014, but forests and wetlands are being lost and degraded rapidly.²

According to Climate Colab, Uganda has confirmed the discovery of 6.5 billion barrels of oil in the Albertine³ region of western Uganda. However, the discovery of oil and gas in the country has raised debate on its potential effects on the pristine ecosystem within the Albertine region. The Albertine region is already witnessing a decrease in tropical high forest as well as woodlands and grasslands, even before the oil and gas activities are fully operational.

The development objective of the Investing in Forests and Protected Areas for Climate-Smart Development Project for Uganda is to improve sustainable management of forests and protected areas and

1 World Bank, Press Release, April 23, 2020: World Bank Invests \$148.2 Million to Improve Uganda's Forest Management and Provide Benefits to Communities, including Refugees: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2020/04/23/world-bank-invests-1482-million-to-improve-ugandas-forest-management-and-provide-benefits-to-communities-including-refugees> (accessed Feb. 2021).

2 Africa Natural Resources Institute indicates that forest cover loss is estimated at 200,000 hectares annually. See Josephat M. "Deforestation in Uganda: population increase, forests loss and climate change." *Environ Risk Assess Remediat.* 2018; 2(2):46-50. See also World Bank, op. cit.

3 <https://www.climatecolab.org/contests/2017/exploring-synergistic-solutions-for-sustainable-development/c/proposal/1334293>

increase benefits to communities from forests in target landscapes. Uganda's landscape is central to the tourism industry and the overall economy, the project is intended both to increase ecosystem goods and services and generate more revenue from forests and protected areas. The project has four components⁴ which are summarized to include:

1. Improved Management of Protected Areas (PAs), \$46.7 million [indicative financing], will focus on improving management of government-managed forest and wildlife PAs to ensure they can continue to generate revenues and provide important environmental services. The Project will finance, under Component one, infrastructure and equipment for management and protection, including through participatory management with communities, of seven National Parks, four Wildlife Reserves, and up to 28 forest reserves.
2. Increased Revenues and Jobs from Forests and Wildlife Protected Areas, \$38.5 million, will increase revenues and jobs from these forests and wildlife PAs through targeted investments in tourism and productive forests. Under this component, development of key tourism infrastructure will be undertaken.
3. Improved Landscape Management in Refugee Hosting Areas, \$58 million, will encourage establishment of greater tree cover in refugee-hosting landscapes on host community land outside PAs, supporting sustainable forest management and landscape resilience on private and customary land. Project Component three will invest in plantation forestry and wood value chains with the aim of enabling plantation forestry to become a strong and self-sustaining economic sector.
4. Project Management and Monitoring, \$5 million, will support overall project management and monitoring.

4 <https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/304401587952865863/uganda-investing-in-forests-and-protected-areas-for-climate-smart-development-project>

Project Monitoring Background and Purpose

Bio Vision Africa (BIVA) and Pro-Biodiversity Conservationists of Uganda (PROBICOU) are working together to promote improved design, implementation, monitoring, and outcomes of the Project with support of the Bank Information Centre.

In this report, we have focused on aspects of the project that relate to the Batwa Indigenous communities as the most marginalized group with potential to be negatively impacted if not thoughtfully addressed—but also with significant potential to contribute to project goals. The population of the Batwa is estimated at 6,200 people (according to the 2014 Uganda Population and Housing Census), or approximately 0.02 per cent of the total population of Uganda. The Batwa have been dispossessed of their land by a combined pressures of government departments responsible for conservation, and the local cultivator's communities. They live in the western and south-western of Uganda in the districts of Bundibugyo, Kabale, Kisoro and Rukungiri.

As the project plans to commence, information available from the Ministry of Water and Environment (MWE) as lead implementing agency indicates that it did extensive consultation with key beneficiaries of the project, including the Batwa in the districts of Kisoro, Rubanda, Kabale and Kanungu. We sought to assess the extent and effectiveness of these consultations since engaging communities, especially Indigenous Peoples, in forest management and monitoring is critical for sustaining forest protection. Moreover, as Indigenous knowledge on forest conservation can and should play a vital role in this area, we sought to see how this knowledge could be integrated in the project plans as it was omitted from the environmental and social assessment. For example, the Batwa have a wealth of knowledge on medicinal plants, which include some 32 species treating a broad range of common ailments, including serious diseases such as malaria and yellow fever [see Annex 1].

However, a response from the World Bank indicated that the Ministry of Water and Environment is preparing site-specific Vulnerable and Marginalised Groups Plan for each of the four target protected areas identified in the Vulnerable and Marginalised Groups Framework. Consultations with the affected communities, including the Batwa, will be a continuous process throughout the project cycle. The project will have two instruments to solicit inputs/feedback from

the beneficiaries, the Stakeholder Engagement Plan and the Vulnerable and Marginalized Group Plan. These will provide measures agreed upon during consultations both to mitigate any potential negative impacts and to maximise benefits from the project in a culturally appropriate and sensitive way. Since the project is not yet fully effective, it has been too early to engage on the scope of all exact activities, but during preparation (as confirmed by the Bank), efforts were made to engage with the Batwa. Bio Vision Africa will therefore continue to monitor the project progress to assess the level of participation and project benefits/impacts to the Batwa communities.

The Monitoring Mission in Western Uganda

Between the 20th and 23rd December 2020, Bio Vision Africa carried out monitoring visits of the project's consultations in Rubanda, Kisoro and Bundibugyo districts. The assessment was specifically carried out among three Batwa communities of Rushaga/Rubuguri town council, Bukimbiri County in Kisoro district, Rwamahano Batwa community in Muko Sub-County, Rubanda district and Bundimasoli Ntandi in Bundibugyo district. Because of the Covid-19 Pandemic and the need to observe SOPs, selected community representatives of the Batwa were met; in Kisoro an estimated population of 1,880, in Rubanda (Kabale) 807 and in Bundibugyo close to 2000 people. In Bundibugyo the team met with the King of the Batwa, who is the cultural leader of the Batwa. The aim of the mission was to find out the role of the indigenous Communities/Batwa in the Project. Bio Vision Africa was able to visit three Batwa communities in Rubanda, Kisoro and Bundibugyo.

Bio-vision Africa was able to visit three communities for the Batwa in Rubanda, Kisoro and Bundibugyo located within the Albertine Graben region. The Batwa community are an indigenous minority group in Uganda that have also been referred to as pygmies because of their short stature. The Batwa were forest-dependent, lived in harmony with forests, and survived by hunting small game using bows and arrows and gathering plants for both food and medicinal purposes. The Batwa in Uganda were evicted from their habitats, the natural forests, and have since become conservation "refugees" in an environment that is very unfamiliar to them. While the Batwa people are still highly skilled to survive in the forest environment, these skills and means of survival are only adequate for the

forest environment and are not very useful in the modern environment out of the forest they are been introduced to. The survival of these communities depended and continue to depend on forests like Echuya Forest Reserve, Semuliki National Park, Bwindi Forest National Park - which is now famous for Gorilla Trekking Tours - and Mgahinga National Park, the only park in Uganda where visitors can track Golden Monkeys. The Project is intended to support; among other things, indigenous forest communities, especially the Batwa living adjacent to National parks in southwestern Uganda.

This assessment was greatly affected by the outbreak of the Covid-19 pandemic as well as the electoral processes in-country that together brought to a standstill virtually all project processes. The two events affected most of the awareness-raising for the project as well as its approval by the cabinet and parliament of Uganda.



A newly constructed Museum of Batwa in Rushaga/ Rubuguri Kisoro district.

The Batwa community today largely suffer from systematic discrimination that has led to their being marginalized both socially and economically, severely limiting their access to education, healthcare, and employment.⁵ In the midst of all these challenges, Batwa have started to engage in some economic
⁵ [Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization \(UNPO\), "Batwa: Poverty and Discrimination Threaten Livelihoods,"](#) November 12, 2018.

activities such as subsistence farming, selling crafts, and supply of cheap labour to the local host communities. However, through their king, the Batwa continue to demand for land for settlement and agriculture like other communities in the country.

Subcomponent 2.1 of the project, to be implemented by Ugandan Wildlife Authority (UWA) and National Forestry Authority (NFA), will invest in tourism infrastructure and products in select national parks (NPs) and Central Forest Reserves (CFRs) in the project area. Being implemented in the NPs and CFRs, which no longer hold local communities, could mean that the participation of such communities, the Batwa in adjacent areas among them, may be excluded. In response to this, the World Bank confirmed that both Uganda Wildlife Authority and National Forest Authority have committed to participatory resource management, including through Collaborative Forest Management (CFM) and Collaborative Resource Management (CRM) groups around National Parks and Central Reserve Forests. Furthermore, National Forest Authority has entered into Collaborative Forest Management agreements with four Collaborative Forest Management associations in managing the buffer zone of the Central Forest Reserve, and in all CFM groups the Batwa were voted into executive committees.



Consultative meeting with the Batwa community of Rwamahano adjacent to Echuya Central Forest Reserve in Muko Sub County, Rubanda district

This is encouraging and will give the Batwa an opportunity to make decisions that directly impact them. The research further reported that their expectations remained very high since they expected additional support from the project.



Crafts targeting tourists made by the Batwa people for their Income.

Although the individual General Management Plans⁶ of NPs and Forest Management Plans of CFRs already identify some investment priorities, the project will rely on a more informed and comprehensive process (by the marketing, planning, and product development specialists) to define and plan investments that can achieve the aim of adding value to the tourist experience and helping Uganda reach and sustain new and more diverse markets. Direct investments will fall in two broad categories: (a) tourist reception, information and interpretive facilities in identified protected areas and (b) infrastructure for new (or improving existing) tourist products and activities.

Project Compliance with World Bank Standards

Like all other World Bank investment projects, the Project is expected to adhere to the Bank's environmental and social standards (ESSs) which provide for a framework for consultation with communities and for public disclosure. While all ESSs except ESS 9 (financial intermediaries) are relevant

⁶ General Management Plans are prepared for all UWA-managed protected areas such as NPs and WRs. Forest Management Plans are prepared for NFA-managed areas such as CFRs.

for the project, this assessment focused on the project's adherence to six ESSs which were deemed as most pertinent at this point. These are:

1. Community Health and Safety (ESS4)

As the project plans for community forest management (CFM) and collaborative resource management (CRM) in connection with restoration of forests, agro-forestry, and livelihood activities that involve human contact, there will be risk of the spread of Covid-19 and other communicable disease which have to be mitigated. The Covid-19 pandemic in particular creates the need for an urgent and robust programme of intervention to promote awareness and provide incentives that could help prevent its spread. Such interventions were yet to be developed and implemented in the project area, especially among the Batwa, who stand out as one of the most vulnerable people. The project has yet to produce essential and easy to understand materials to help disseminate information to the Batwa. As implementation begins, there will be increased human activity and this will increase the risk of the spread of Covid-19 and other communicable diseases.

Response from the World Bank indicated that as part the Vulnerable and Marginalised Group Framework (VMGF) and the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF), the Government of Uganda did commit to produce easily understandable materials in local languages and different formats accessible to local communities. However, with ongoing COVID threats, hard copy leaflets for distribution are not appropriate and so, during this period, preference will be for use of posters and audio messages. The Bank further confirmed that Government of Uganda agencies will adhere to all relevant COVID-19 SOPs that will be in place during implementation to mitigate health and safety risks. Provision of adequate equipment, safety awareness by contractors and implementing agencies, signage, road flaggers, and proper training for operators of heavy equipment will be undertaken.

Since the project's civil works will mainly be undertaken in protected areas, the number of communities affected by these works is expected to be limited, but to the extent they border Batwa communities, adverse social impacts such as displacement, sexual exploitation and abuse, the transmission of communicable diseases such as HIV/AIDS on affected communities may also occur, and preventive measures should be put in place.

The World Bank confirmed that such risk may occur and have been highlighted in the project Environmental and Social Management Framework and therefore, relevant provisions will be included in contracts for civil works. Furthermore, the Bank's standard bidding documents also include specific Sexual Exploitation, Abuse, and Harassment (SEA/H) clauses and set clear expectations in contract conditions by stipulating obligations to manage Gender-Based Violence (GBV) and SEA/H risks that are within the contractors' control. Once the project is fully effective, Bio Vision Africa will continue to monitor how both the World Bank and Government of Uganda prevent, mitigate, and respond to such risks.

2. Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement (ESS5)

In its introduction, the project appraisal document correctly asserts that, *"Poor and vulnerable people typically live in rural areas, have large families, and derive their income predominantly from farming, with high dependency on forests."*⁷ Similarly the Batwa people are poor and very vulnerable, but unlike other communities in Uganda, they do not own land for cultivation and therefore cannot largely produce their own food. The Batwa still lay claim on their ancestral lands, which are the forests from where they

⁷ Project Information Document (PID), p.4: <https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/842571580296040060/project-information-document-uganda-investing-in-forests-and-protected-areas-for-climate-smart-development-project-p170466>

were involuntarily expelled, forests that are currently being targeted for better management under this project. Before they were forced out of these forests, which served as their traditional habitat, to which they were well-adapted, the Batwa say they lived a happy and better life than they live today.

The Batwa still believe that they have not been adequately compensated by government for their lost land when the forested land they lived in was converted into forest reserves and national parks. The Batwa see this new project as an opportune time through which their right to land will be addressed and secure land tenure provided to them. To manage expectations, it's therefore important to continuously communicate to the Batwa that this request is outside the project scope. Although this project doesn't provide for compensation of land, it is still incumbent upon government of Uganda to resettle the Batwa community and provide them with secure land tenure and access to lands to which they are adapted. The Batwa case has never been resolved, according to Emmanuel Kajubu of the Uganda Radio Network; *"...a local NGO, Rural Welfare Improvement for Development (RWIDE), under a Shillings 500 million [US\$140,000] World Bank funded project, was supposed to build semi-permanent houses for 40 Batwa [families]. However, only 10 houses were constructed, leaving majority of the Batwa homeless. This forced many of them to return to the national park."*⁸

⁸ <https://ugandaradionetwork.net/story/bundibugyo-district-resettles-batwa-community?districtId=502>



The Batwa in Bundibugyo pose for a photo in front of their King's house in March 2013.

3. Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources (ESS6)

ESS6 among other things “addresses sustainable management of primary production and harvesting of living natural resources, and recognizes the need to consider the livelihood of project-affected parties, including Indigenous Peoples, whose access to, or use of, biodiversity or living natural resources may be affected by a project.”⁹ The Batwa community currently do not know how or even whether their right to access to at least the same forest resources as they have now will be guaranteed. However, despite all shortcomings they face in their livelihoods, they are still fully committed to protecting and conserving biodiversity and ensuring the sustainable management of the natural resources. Moreover, they proudly seek to contribute towards maintaining the core ecological functions of the forests and the biodiversity therein. However, they ask government to put in place and sustain a system that allows them to sustainably harvest medicinal plants and other non-timber forest products from the forests.

To this, the World Bank confirmed that the Government of Uganda has started to put such systems in place as in the Vulnerable and Marginalised Group Framework that identifies agreed arrangements for resource use in Echuya Forest with clear preference for the Batwa. Bio Vision Africa will continue to monitor how well such systems will work in response to the Batwa needs.

4. Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities (ESS7)

ESS7 is intended to ensure that the development process fosters full respect for the human rights, dignity, aspirations, identity, culture, and natural resource-based livelihoods of Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities. The Batwa Community indicated that they have been victimized by both the host communities and the UWA (park authority) who have considered them criminals even when they did nothing wrong. Because of their levels of illiteracy, the Batwa say they cannot ably defend themselves in formal courts of law and they lack any form of legal representation. ESS7 also requires the Free, Prior Informed Consent of covered groups such as the Batwa whenever adverse impacts are anticipated on their lands, resources, cultural

heritage, or land use or occupancy.¹⁰

While in principle the project should benefit the Batwa, it is possible that a number of activities, e.g. construction of new facilities and infrastructure within and around protected areas, could have adverse impacts, particularly in the context described above. Even if FPIC is deemed not to apply, ESS 7 is meant to avoid adverse impacts of projects on Indigenous Peoples, or when avoidance is not possible, to minimize, mitigate and/or compensate for such impacts, and informed consultation must take place to achieve these. Based on our meetings with the Batwa communities, it appears that:

- a. The Batwa anticipate adverse impacts, including (further) loss of livelihoods and possible displacement, from the new construction within and around parks;
- b. They have not been provided FPIC, nor even had fully informed consultation;
- c. They are unaware of future consultation plans and are not accurately informed about future project impacts or benefits.

Response from the World Bank indicated that since the project is not yet fully effective, it's too early to engage on in-depth consultations or consider applicability of FPIC. Bio Vision will therefore continue to monitor the status of the project and activities therein, with a focus on stakeholder engagement and potential applicability of FPIC.

The Batwa identified the following as some of the major challenges faced:

¹⁰ Specifically, the Borrower will obtain the FPIC of the affected Communities “in circumstances in which the project will: (a) have adverse impacts on land and natural resources subject to traditional ownership or under customary use or occupation; (b) cause relocation of Indigenous Peoples/ Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities from land and natural resources subject to traditional ownership or under customary use or occupation; or (c) have significant impacts on Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities’ cultural heritage that is material to the identity and/or cultural, ceremonial, or spiritual aspects of the affected Indigenous Peoples/ Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities’ lives.”

⁹ [World Bank Environmental and Social Standards \(ESS\)](#), accessed 2/26/2021.

Major challenges faced by the Batwa	Forms of support required
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of access to forest or forest resources from the national park 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased access to forest products - especially to medicinal plants from the forest
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack training and tools for cultivation, resulting into food insecurity. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Farm aid, they need training and tools for intensive farming, plus food aid to survive during hard times
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Batwa are used by some NGOs who masquerade as their representatives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support/capacity building for their (Batwa) own organizations - to benefit from eco-tourism activities
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Limited or no employment opportunities from National Parks. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase Batwa incomes through employment as guides, nature experts, etc. in National Parks Build a centre/support tourism-related activities and infrastructure for the Batwa

On a positive note, most of the support required is already mentioned in the Vulnerable and Marginalized Group Framework and will be provided under this project. Bio Vision Africa will therefore continue to monitor the project to assess how well or not the project is impacting the Batwa communities.

5. Cultural Heritage (ESS8)

The Batwa people are culturally attached to Mgahinga, Echuya and Semuliki forests, among others, to which they trace their cultural heritage or ancestry. The communities intimated that in these forests they have a considerable number of important cultural and spiritual sites like hot springs, shrines, caves, rivers, hills, and many others. To date, the Batwa confirm that they still practice their cultural and spiritual ceremonies in these forests with the full knowledge of the forest authorities. However, they worry whether the new project will allow them to continue, without any interruption, their cultural and spiritual ceremonies in the forests. This means that the Batwa still lack adequate information about the project. According to World Bank staff, although some consultations have been done in preparing the project, more will be done once GoU has approved it and implementation begins. The ESRS meanwhile states it is unknown if there is any presence of culturally significant sites associated with the project. The Bank clearly needs to advise the MWE as implementing agency that important cultural sites do overlap the project area and ESS8 does apply.

The World Bank welcomed this insight and confirmed that the Vulnerable and Marginalized Group Framework records the existing importance

of forests to the Batwa communities who are given preferential treatment when it comes to access to forest resources, including visiting ancestral sites. The Bank further confirmed that no new restrictions on these access rights will be imposed by the project, and this will be communicated by the GoU project teams in their engagements with the local communities, including the Batwa. Bio Vision Africa welcomed this commitment and will continue to monitor the project with a focus on how such commitments are being kept.

6. Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure (ESS10)

ESS10 provides for the project to “Ensure that appropriate project information is disclosed to stakeholders in a timely, understandable, accessible and appropriate manner. ESS10 emphasizes stakeholder engagement throughout the project life-cycle, and requires a Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP).” We noted that the project was able to carry out some degree of stakeholder engagement and information disclosure through community engagement meetings, especially in the project areas that we were able to visit.

Sub-component 1.2 of the project [“Increasing the involvement of local communities in the management of forest and wildlife areas by increasing their access and benefits from these areas”] is to support technical assistance packages and training aimed at developing the skills at community level to actively participate and benefit from the management of forest and wildlife resources, including enhancing their adaptive capacity. However, little is mentioned

on how communities with no or poor formal education like the Batwa would eventually benefit from such programmes. Additionally, there is no evidence of other forms of simplified information for awareness that could be easily understood by the largely illiterate Batwa community. Given this fact, there is need for simplified information for dissemination to these disadvantaged communities in their language.

Response from the Bank confirmed that such information has not yet been developed. However,

the Ministry of Water and Environment has committed to develop such culturally appropriate materials, especially a summary of the Vulnerable and Marginalized Group Framework. This is especially important to manage expectations from the communities who see the project as a big source of income to leapfrog out of their economic and social challenges. It has also been realised that the project is yet to establish a systematic approach/plan to stakeholder engagement to maintain a constructive relationship with them as required under ESS10.



Old and vulnerable: Many old Batwa risk catching Covid-19 because they don't observe SOPs



Food Aid to the Batwa in Bundibugyo

Recommendations

1. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PROJECT/GOVERNMENT:

- 1a. Prioritize and expedite its activities addressing awareness of and response to the needs of the Batwa people in the different project areas and components.
- 1b. Communicate project plans and options clearly to manage the expectations and gather feedback of the communities, especially the Batwa indigenous communities.
- 1c. Integrate affected communities, including the Batwa, into project activities, including NP infrastructure planning and installation, collaborative resource management, and community forest management.

- 1d. Ensure that rights to access and sustainable use of the forest products and resources by the local host communities is guaranteed.
- 1e. Explore options for Government to resettle the Batwa communities who want it as one way of resolving outstanding land /tenure challenges, along with compensation and livelihoods restoration from government since it has never provided these to the Batwa from the time they were evicted from the forests.
- 1f. Improve the education system for the Batwa people – government should ensure that the education is free and accessible.
- 1g. Put in place deliberate actions that effectively integrate the Batwa people into host community institutions to eliminate discrimination and stigmatization, while

supporting maintenance of Batwa culture.

- 1h. Protect the Batwa community from Covid-19 as well as from sexual exploitation, abuse, and harassment (SEAH) from the host communities and support treatment for affected Batwa HIV-AIDS victims.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE WORLD BANK:

- 2a. Should FPIC be required, the Bank should support the Government to obtain, fulfill and monitor FPIC of Batwa communities for activities in and around national parks or areas close to their settlements, bearing in mind that FPIC is an ongoing process requiring adaptive management during the project.
- 2b. Include and monitor participation of project-affected peoples in community forest management and collaborative resource management as a metric for project success (hectares managed via CFM/CRM).
- 2c. Explore as a project output collection, documentation, dissemination and application of Indigenous knowledge from the Batwa communities on sustainable forest management.
- 2d. Ensure the project allocates sufficient resources to educate, train, restore livelihoods, and secure lands and access to natural resources for the Batwa communities.
- 2e. Advise the MWE as implementing agency that important cultural sites do overlap the project area, ESS8 does apply, and protection of cultural heritage is required.
- 2f. Require preventive measures be put in place against adverse social impacts such as displacement, SEAH, and transmission of communicable diseases (COVID or HIV/AIDS), and specifically include prevention and awareness of SEAH for the Batwa communities.
- 2g. Consider parallels between the Batwa and other marginalized groups affected by the project, notably refugees, and ensure that stakeholder engagement and information disclosure is conducted for these groups in a safe, accessible, and timely manner.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LOCAL COMMUNITIES AND CIVIL SOCIETY:

- 3a. Local communities that wish to participate in, or expect benefits from, the project may wish to meet, or appoint a representative to meet, with MWE or UWA officials in charge of implementing the project in their area to better understand its planned activities and likely impacts, and to communicate their expectations, needs and/or demands.
- 3b. Community-based organizations working on natural resources management issues should consult with project implementers (MWE, UWA, or regional staff) to see about opportunities for engagement and training, for example, in community-based forest monitoring or tree planting and forest and landscape restoration initiatives.
- 3c. Other constituencies in project-affected communities that have an interest in the project outcomes or natural resources management more broadly should communicate with community leaders or project representatives to seek to have their needs and requests addressed in project implementation.

Annexes

Annex 1: Species used by the Batwa to treat common ailments

PLANT SPECIES	AILMENT TREATED
<i>Acacia sp.</i>	Constipation
<i>Adenostemma caffra</i>	Sore throat
<i>Ageratum conyzoides and Erigeron floribunda</i>	Antitussive
<i>Agrocharis incognita</i>	Indigestion, worms
<i>Albizia gummifera</i>	Labor induction
<i>Anisopappus africanus</i>	Headache
<i>Basella alba</i>	Snakebite
<i>Bothriocline ugandensis</i>	Stomach ache
<i>Centella asiatica</i>	Joint pain
<i>Commelina Africana</i>	Conjunctivitis
<i>Crassocephalum biafrae</i>	Malaria
<i>Crassocephalum montuosum</i>	Fever or Wounds
<i>Cyphostemma adenocaula</i>	Yellow fever
<i>Dicliptera laxata</i>	Dysentery
<i>Dicliptera leonotis</i>	Diarrhea
<i>Dombeya goetzennii</i>	Indigestion
<i>Erlangea cordifolia</i>	Stomach ache
<i>Erythrina abyssinica</i>	Candidiasis
<i>Ficus asperifolia</i>	'Kidney trouble'
<i>Ficus ottoniifolia and Ficus ovata</i>	galactagogue
<i>Impatiens stuhlmannii</i>	Skin rash
<i>Indigofera arrecta</i>	Dysmenorrhea
<i>Mackaya bella</i>	Anti-abortive
<i>Pennisetum purpureum</i>	Induce labor
<i>Senna septemtrionalis</i>	Wounds, snakebite
<i>Sesbania sesban</i>	Stomach ache
<i>Tephrosia interrupta</i>	Antidiarrheal
<i>Thunbergia alata</i>	Fever
<i>Vernonia auriculifera</i>	Malaria
<i>Vernonia brachycalyx</i>	Fever
<i>Virectaria major</i>	Back ache
<i>Zanthoxylum gillettii</i>	Worms, sore throat

Annex 2: Ministry of Water and Environment responses to the Report



Introduction:

1. The report is prepared as an effort by Bio Vision Africa (BIVA) and Pro-Biodiversity Conservationists of Uganda¹ (PROBICOU) working together to promote improved design, implementation, monitoring the outcomes of the Project. The two Uganda based NGOs are supported by the Bank Information Centre (BIC)[.]
2. The report is based on Monitoring visits by the two NGOs between the 20th and 23rd December 2020, in Rubanda, Kisoro and Bundibugyo districts covering three Batwa communities of Rushaga/Rubuguri town council, Bukimbiri County in Kisoro district, Rwamahano Batwa community in Muko Sub-County, Rubanda district and Bundimasoli Ntandi in Bundibugyo district.
3. The report focuses on aspects of the IFPA-CD project that relate to the Batwa Indigenous communities. The Batwa were identified as the IPs living in/adjacent to following four (4) Project Sites namely; Echuya Central Forest Reserve, Mgahinga, Bwindi Impenetrable and Semliki National Parks. Specifically, the report presents an assessment of the “extent and effectiveness of consultations” with Batwa of Kisoro, Rubanda, Kabale² and Kanungu districts³ during the project preparatory /design process.

Responses to the Report findings and Recommendations

4. Overall, the report presents futuristic and forward looking assessment with recommendations that would render the project responsive to the issues that would benefit Batwa whilst avoiding negative impacts due to project supported activities.
5. The assessment concurs with the issues captured in the IFPA-CD Project ESMF and VMGF. Likewise, the recommended actions do qualify to be included in the VMGMPs for Echuya CFR, Mgahinga, Bwindi and Semuliki National parks, respectively, that are under preparation (by MWE with support from a Consultant (Mr. Paul Twebaze, who works with PROBICOU). However, some of the assessment findings and recommendations refer to policy and institutional issues that are outside the scope of the IFPA-CD project, as indicated in Table 1.
6. The assessment does not provide clear information on how to ensure that Batwa genuinely participate in IFPA-CD Project implementation.
7. The assessment does not take into account various ongoing actions targeting Batwa in the project area by UWA, NFA and other NGOs and development Agencies (refer to Section 3 of the VMGF).

1 PROBICOU has provided services to Ministry of Water and Environment in [these] key tasks:

1. Mainstreaming Gender and Strengthen Capacity of IPs in REDD+ Implementation- under REDD+ Programme
2. Preparing Vulnerable and Marginalized Groups Process Framework – under the Investment in Forests and Protected Areas for Climate Smart Project (IPA-CD Project)

2 Kabale district does not fall under the IFPA-CD Project area.

3 Consultations with Batwa during project preparation/design included Batwa in Bundibugyo District.

Issues	Finding/ Recommendation	MWE response
Use of indigenous Knowledge (IK) and practices”	Utilize Batwa IK in forest management and monitoring of medicinal Plants	<p>There is ongoing engagement between Batwa and NFA and UWA in forest and Park management, respectively. There is ongoing engagement through Collaborative Forest Management agreements, Tourism, employment as guides, etc. as reported in section 3 of the VMGF (March 2020))</p> <p>There is intention to strengthen/foster these engagements to tackle the likely impact of the project on Batwa Section 4 of the VGMF) though actions that are expected to be included in the Vulnerable and Marginalised Groups Management Plan currently under preparation.</p>
Strengthening Forest Management (Project Component 2.1)	Page 6 of the report: Tourism infrastructure development and tourism product diversification... will exclude Batwa participation	<p>This finding/conclusion in wrong. The IFPA-CD investments aim to:</p> <p>Provide grants to communities (including Batwa) up to US\$ 1.0m to support tourism activities. Criterion for selecting beneficiary communities and modalities for the engagement favour participation of Batwa in this activity.</p> <p>IFPA-CD investment include diversifying tourism products including promotion of Batwa Culture and crafts under community initiatives.</p> <p>Investment in tourism infrastructure is intended to boost tourism activity that will provide market for Batwa products, employment and over-all, generate revenues that would increase the amount of funds disbursed by UWA under the Revenue Sharing Scheme to which Batwa are beneficiaries.</p> <p>The VMGMP will elaborate on the actions that would increase opportunities for Batwa to participate in and benefit from project investments in tourism.</p>
Community Health and Safety (ESS4)	Promoting awareness on COVID-19	<p>The MWE greatly appreciates the ongoing awareness effort by COVID-19 Task forces at national and district level, UWA and NFA at field levels, including messages that target Batwa. MWE appreciates efforts by the Greater Virunga Transboundary Collaboration (GVTC) that prepared and is implementing COVID-19 Emergent response plan in and round Mt Gorilla range where Mgahinga Gorilla National Park and Bwindi Impenetrable NP area.</p> <p>The UWA and NFA has developed and enforce SoPs for all staff and contractors, visitors and community’s members who interact with for the Forest/Park management. These SoPs apply to Batwa.</p>
Land acquisition (ESS5)	Historical injustices to Batwa	<p>The IFPA CD project activities do not include land acquisition, restriction to land access/use and involuntary resettlement.</p> <p>Hence, ESS5 is not applicable to IFPA-CD Project</p>

Issues	Finding/ Recommendation	MWE response
Biodiversity conservation (ESS6)	Right to access	<p>The Forest and Wildlife policies and legislation recognize and provide for the access to forest resources by communities, including Batwa.</p> <p>These provisions have been operationalised through CFM (in Echuya CFR) and CRM programmes in the targeted national Parks. IFPA – CD investments target “Increasing the involvement of local communities in the management of forest and wildlife areas by increasing their access and benefits from these areas increase benefits to communities... Sub component 1.2. Under this component 27 CFM and 75 CRM initiatives will be supported. Batwa will be beneficiaries of this support.</p> <p>Under sub component 1.3 (Restoration of forest), it is intended to use local labour, including Batwa in Echuya CFR.</p> <p>Under sub component 1.2 (Control invasive ...Bamboo in Echuya), it is intended to use local labour, including Batwa</p>
Indigenous People (ESS7)	IFPIC	<p>The IFPA-CD has consulted with Batwa during the project design with sessions specific with Batwa (ref IFPA-CD SEP), during the preparation of ESMF, during preparation of VMGF. Evidence of their participation is presented in these documents.</p> <p>The ongoing process of preparing the VMGMP is dedicated to Batwa and their full engagement will be secured during this process</p> <p>FPIC will be applied in circumstances required under ESS7.</p>
	The challenges identified by Batwa	The challenges that are applicable to the IFPA-CD project will be incorporated in the VMGP.
Cultural Heritage (ESS8)	Access to and use of cultural sites and values	<p>The Forestry and wildlife policies and legislation recognizes these values and provides for their continued access and use.</p> <p>Cultural values/resources within the targeted PAs have been documented and their use is ongoing.</p> <p>The IPFA – CD ESMF recognizes these values and their continued use will be monitored and reported under the ESMF.</p>
Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure (ESS10)	Batwa benefit from the IFPA CD	<p>As above under ESS 7- ESS 9</p> <p>As above under sub component 1.3. 3.1 etc.</p>
	Provision for engaging marginalized people, including refugees, women, children, PWD, elderly, etc.	IFPA-CD strategies are elaborated in the ESMF, VMGF, SEP, etc.

Issues	Finding/ Recommendation	MWE response
Recommendations to IFPA-CD/ Government	Several	<p>The following will be incorporated in the VMGMP</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Awareness activities and outreach Engagement in provision of labour and local materials in infrastructure development, forest restoration, tourism, etc. Participation in CFM, CRM, Ecotourism, COVID 19 and other diseases <p>The following recommendations will be forwarded to relevant authorities for attention:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Batwa education Land access/ownership Social integration